FEDERAL BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION

Date of transcription 4/27/93

b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e) on provided information listed in United States District Court, Western District of New York, subpoena number which was served on him by Special Agents (SAs) and.

The information consists of was provided to SA

Investigation on 4/27/93 at Amherst, New York File # 65W-BF-28197-37

by SA Date dictated 4/27/93

This document contains neither recommendations nor conclusions of the FBI. It is the property of the FBI and is loaned to your agency; it and its contents are not to be distributed outside your agency.
SECRET

CITE: 6/30706//

PASS: ICC INTD, CI-1C.

SUBJECT: WEIZMANN INSTITUTE OF SCIENCE: ESPIONAGE - ISRAEL: 00: BF.

THIS COMMUNICATION IS CLASSIFIED "SECRET" IN ITS ENTIRETY.

RE BIRMINGHAM TELETYPE TO BUFFALO DATED JUNE 3, 1993 AND BUFFALO TELCALL OF SA________ TO SA________ ON JUNE 22, 1993.

BUFFALO ADVISED THAT THEIR ENTIRE OFFICE IS INVOLVED WITH
UPCOMING WORLD UNIVERSITY GAMES, JULY 8 -18, 1993, AT BUFFALO.

MAJOR CASE #67.

SA BUFFALO DIVISION, ADVISED THAT BECAUSE OF

MAJOR CASE #67, SHE WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO ADDRESS CAPTIONED

MATTER UNTIL APPROXIMATELY SEPTEMBER 1, 1993.

BIRMINGHAM IS PLACING THIS MATTER IN A "RUC" STATUS AND

WILL REOPEN WHEN REQUESTED TO DO SO BY BUFFALO. ANY FURTHER

COMMUNICATION CONCERNING THIS MATTER SHOULD BE ADDRESSED TO SA

C BY C-31, DEEL ON OABR.

BT

#0002

NANN
302 dated 10/4/93 and Witness Affidavit of
Memorandum

To: SAC (65W-BF-28197) (P) SECRET
(ATTN: SA)

From: SA

Subject: WEIZMANN INSTITUTE OF SCIENCE;
ESPIONAGE - ISRAEL
OO: BUFFALO

Date 11/30/93

This communication is classified "Secret" in its entirety.

On 11/22/93 (reliable, position to know)
advise that the information concerning captioned subject:

Name:
Sex:
DOB:
POB:
SSAN:
Marital Status:
Permanent Residence:

Local Residence:

Telephone:
Student Number:
NYSID:

Records further reflect that:

PFS: 65W-BF-28197-39

Classified By: G-3
Declassify On: OADR

NOV 30 1993
Above for information Case Agent.
On October 6, 1993, pursuant to United States District Court, Western District of New York, subpoena number by Special Agent (SA) which was served on by Special Agent (SA) pursuant to United States District Court, Western District of New York.

Investigation on 10/6/93 at Amherst, New York File # 65W-BF-28197-381

This document contains neither recommendations nor conclusions of the FBI. It is the property of the FBI and is loaned to your agency; it and its contents are not to be distributed outside your agency.
TO: DIRECTOR, FBI (ATTN: IOC NSD, CT-1C)

FROM: SAC, BUFFALO (65W-BF-28197) (P)

SUBJECT: WEIZMANN INSTITUTE OF SCIENCE; ESPIONAGE-ISRAEL (COMPUTER HACKING); (OO: BUFFALO)

This entire communication is classified "SECRET."

Reference Buffalo airtel and Letterhead Memorandum (LHM) dated 4/16/93 and captioned as above.

Enclosed for the Bureau are the original and five copies of the

For the information of the Bureau source providing information in enclosed LHM is identified as who is in a position to know and who has previously provided reliable information.

Classified by: G-3
Declassify on: OADR

3 - Bureau (Encs. 6)
Buffalo

Approved: Transmitted Per

FILE COPY
In Reply, Please Refer to

File No. 111 West Huron street
Buffalo, N.Y. 14202
March 11, 1994

WEIZMANN INSTITUTE OF SCIENCE;
ESPIONAGE-ISRAEL (COMPUTER HACKING);

This entire communication is classified "Secret."

Office of Origin: Buffalo Division, Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI).


Basis for Investigation: Initial investigation conducted by FBI Albuquerque and FBI Phoenix indicated that subject, born at Middletown, New York, utilized a fictitious computer identity to access a computer located at New Mexico State University (NMSU) and through NMSU access computers at Yuma Proving Ground (YPG), Yuma, Arizona. Information provided by NMSU, also indicated computers from the WEIZMANN INSTITUTE OF SCIENCE (WIS) accessed computers from NMSU to penetrate computers at YPG. A comparative study of transmission patterns, dates and times among the WIS, NMSU, and YPG computer systems determined the possible scenario that subject was downloading data collected for subject WIS in their contact with and accessing of YPG computers via NMSU system.

Investigative Steps Taken to Date: On March 8, 1993, Assistant District Attorney (ADA), Erie County, Amherst, New York, advised the original charge of "misuse of a computer" lodged against the subject was reduced to a charge of "disorderly conduct." ADA explained subject was allowed to plead guilty to the reduced charge for the following reasons: this is his first offense; officials at the State University of New York at Buffalo (UB), where the subject attends college, were not "overly anxious" to have the

This document contains neither recommendations nor conclusions of the FBI. It is the property of the FBI and is loaned to your agency; it and its contents are not to be distributed outside your agency.
WEIZMANN INSTITUTE OF SCIENCE;
ESPIONAGE-ISRAEL (COMPUTER HACKING)

matter pursued; and the matter is of investigative interest to the FBI. According to ADA [ ], the subject is now guilty of a violation and not of a crime. No attempts were made by local authorities to determine the nature and amount of information accessed by [ ], what he did with information accessed; and if he acted alone or in concert with others.

On this same date, [ ] appeared in Amherst Town Court before Town Justice [ ] and pled guilty to the reduced charge. Justice [ ] imposed the following sentence on the subject: $100.00 fine plus $45.00 mandatory surcharge and 40 hours of community service at UB. [ ] was also ordered to stay away from unauthorized computers. During the proceedings [ ] advised Justice[ ] his parents were financing his college education. For court records the subject provided his local address as [ ] and his home address as [ ].

On [ ] a subpoena was served on [ ].

On [ ] United States District Court (USDC), Western District of New York (WDNY), subpoena number [ ] was personally served on [ ] set forth in the subpoena.
On a second subpoena was provided by the United States Attorney's Office, WDNY, on to a representative of the FBI.

On to the representative of the FBI.
At this time, stated to the FBI representative that

On this same date, provided to a representative of the FBI information requested in subpoena number [ ], which was previously served on him on [ ].

was provided to the FBI representative.

Investigation by Buffalo indicated subject was scheduled to graduate from UB in May of 1993; however, subject did not meet all academic requirements. Throughout the summer, Buffalo attempted to coordinate with the New York Division in an effort to locate subject without success.

On October 6, 1993, completed a WITNESS AFFIDAVIT attesting that [ ] Pursuant to the subpoena served on [ ].
At this time, [redacted] also advised that [redacted]

On November 22, 1993, a source who is in a position to know and who has previously provided reliable information, advised that [redacted]

Source advised that [redacted]

On January 25, 1994, FBI Buffalo coordinated with FBI Washington Metropolitan Field Office (WMFO) to provide WMFO pertinent background information and information retrieved from computer databases at UB for review, analysis and recommendations by the Computer Emergency Response Team (CERT). According to information provided by WMFO, CERT works through liaison with the Department of Defense (DOD) in investigating computer hacking of DOD computer systems.

On February 3, 1994, [redacted] made application to the Graduate School at UB.

Objective: The purpose of this investigation continues to be to fully identify all individuals and institutions involved with the penetration of the YPG computer systems and the penetration of other classified and/or sensitive systems; determine the purpose and extent of foreign involvement in the penetration; and identify all data accessed and/or obtained by subjects as a result of the penetration.
TO: ADIC, WMFO (ATTN: SQUAD C-17, NVMRA)
FROM: SAC, BUFFALO (65W-BF-28197) (P)
SUBJECT: WEIZMANN INSTITUTE OF SCIENCE; ESPIONAGE-ISRAEL (COMPUTER HACKING); (00: BUFFALO)

This entire communication is classified "SECRET."

Reference 1/25/94 telcall between SA Buffalo and SA WMFO.

Enclosed for WMFO is pertinent background information detailing origin of captioned investigation. Also enclosed are copies of a student at the State University of New York at Buffalo (UB). Buffalo is also enclosing SA advised during re telcall of Computer Emergency Response Team (CERT) at WMFO which has established liaison with Department of Defense (DOD) in investigating computer hacking of DOD computer systems.

Classified by: G-3
Declassify on: OADR

Approved: ___________ Transmitted ___________ Per ___________
By way of background, initial investigation conducted by the Albuquerque and Phoenix Divisions indicated that subject, a United States person, born and utilized a fictitious computer identity to access a computer located at New Mexico State University (NMSU) and through NMSU access computers at Yuma Proving Ground (YPG), Yuma, Arizona. Information provided by NMSU, also indicated computers from the WEIZMANN INSTITUTE of SCIENCE (WIS) in Israel accessed computers from NMSU to penetrate computers at YPG. A comparative study of transmission patterns, dates and times among the WIS, NMSU, and YPG computer systems determined the possible scenario that subject was downloading data collected for subject WIS in their contact with and accessing of YPG computers via NMSU system.

Investigation by Buffalo disclosed subject was arrested by an officer of UB's Department of Public Safety on 10/8/92, and was initially charged with "misuse of a computer." Information provided by the Director of Engineering Computing at UB and officials at UB's Computing and Information Technology Center indicated subject was repeatedly warned about his unauthorized use of computers and computer account passwords. He failed to heed the warning, and when discovered by campus police using an unauthorized computer terminal, he was arrested.

On 3/8/93, subject pled guilty to a reduced charge of "disorderly conduct"; he received a $100.00 fine plus $45.00 mandatory surcharge and was sentenced to perform 40 hours of community service at UB. Subject was "ordered" to stay away from unauthorized computers.

On 4/27/93, subject was advised that having the account number enabled those who had it to access various computer systems at UB and other facilities throughout the world. Subject did not know the identities or the number of people in Israel to whom gave his computer account. Subject did not know if gave the computer account to others which would enable them to access various systems.
Lead:

WMFO at NVMRA:

WMFO, CERT, is requested to review and analyze information enclosed, and through liaison with DOD, determine plausibility of scenario that was downloading data collected for WIS in their contact with and accessing of YPG computers via NMSU system. WMFO is requested to provide results and recommendations to Buffalo.
TO: SAC, BUFFALO
FROM: ADIC, WMFO (65W-BF-28197) (RUC)

WEIZMANN INSTITUTE OF SCIENCE;
ESPIONAGE-ISRAEL (COMPUTER HACKING);
(CO: BUFFALO)

This communication is classified "SECRET" in its entirety.

Reference Buffalo airtel, dated 3/14/94, and
telcall, 4/14/94, between BF SA and WMFO.

Enclosed for Buffalo are one copy each of 10
documents provided by Buffalo marked as exhibits described
below.
The hard copy material provided by Buffalo to WMFO for review has been destroyed at WMFO. The material provided by Buffalo have been filed as 6e material under the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure.

Summary Conclusion and Recommendation:

Based on a review of the enclosed material and discussion with SA WMFO believes the subject is/was a low level cracker with only a rudimentary skill level. The chance of the subject being a knowing agent of a foreign power appears to be virtually nil. It is recommended the subject be interviewed in order to bring this case to a logical conclusion.

Details:

The captioned case is of the type virtually identical to dozens of complaints received at WMFO in recent years and worked as a Computer Fraud and Abuse matter (Classification 264). This case would most likely not have been worked at WMFO due to local prosecutive action. However, we may have attempted to interview the subject to determine if he was responsible for more serious intrusions.

This attack was very rudimentary. Most sophisticated crackers weave through several networks and network nodes before attacking a system. This weaving virtually precludes tracing the attack. Numerous systems on the Internet are "pinged" every day. The fact that Yuma Proving Ground systems are pinged means nothing. The NCCS is aware of two crackers attacking a machine at the same time; however, the proposed scenario that subject in New York was downloading files in connection with an attack from Israel does not make sense since on the Internet it is just as easy and fast to move files to Israel as it is to New York.

The following points are based on the material provided by BF:

1) FD-302 with attachments reflecting interview of on 4/27/93. Subject told...
2) FD-302 with attachments reflecting the interview of [Redacted] on 4/7/93.

Contacts:

Referral/Consult

RUC:

SECRET
TRANSMIT VIA: AIRTEL
CLASSIFICATION: SECRET
DATE: 8/10/94

FROM: Director, FBI
TO: SAC, Buffalo (65W-BF-28197)

WEIZMANN INSTITUTE OF SCIENCE;
ESPIONAGE-ISRAEL(COMPUTER HACKING)
00:BF

This communication classified "SECRET" in its entirety.

Re FBIHQ teletype dated 4/7/94, and telephone conversations between FBIHQ, NSD, NS-1C, IOS and Buffalo SA 4/13/94, and 6/16/94.

As check of FOIMS was made on 8/10/94, and according to FOIMS this investigation is still pending. Buffalo is requested to immediately close this investigation, and provide FBIHQ with a closing communication in this investigation.
TO: DIRECTOR, FBI
FROM: SAC, Buffalo (65W-BF-28197) (C)
SUBJECT: WEIZMANN INSTITUTE OF SCIENCE; ESPIONAGE-ISRAEL (COMPUTER HACKING)

This communication is classified "SECRET" in its entirety.

Re FBIHQ airtel dated 8/10/94; and Buffalo telcal of SA to IOS FBIHQ, NSD, NS-1C on 8/30/94.

Based on information contained in re FBIHQ airtel and re Buffalo telcal, Buffalo is conducting no further investigation and is placing captioned matter in a closed status.

Classified by: 3786
Declassify On: OADR

2 - Bureau
1 - Buffalo

Approved: ____________________ Transmitted (Number) (Time) Per. ____________________
In Reply, Please Refer to File No.

1400 Federal Building
Buffalo, New York 14202
July 27, 1995

Honorable Patrick H. NeMoyer
United States Attorney
Western District of New York
138 Delaware Avenue
Buffalo, New York 14202
Attention: Assistant United States Attorney

RE: United States v.
Your File #92R1172

Dear


A review by FBI Headquarters and in conjunction with FBI, Buffalo, determined above matter did not meet the standard for continued investigation by the FBI.

It should be noted that was charged with and pled guilty to disorderly conduct in the Town of Amherst Court. He was fined and sentenced to perform community service.

The facts of this matter reveal that is a low-level cracker with only a rudimentary skill level whose attack was very rudimentary.

Sincerely,

JOSEPH R. WOLFINGER
Special Agent in Charge

By:
Supervisory Special Agent
Memorandum

ALL INFORMATION CONTAINED HERIN IS UNCLASSIFIED
DATE 01-11-2012 BY UC60322LP/PLJ/CC

To : SAC, BUFFALO (65W-BF-28197)
From : SAC, PHOENIX (65W-BF-28197)

Subject: WEIZMANN INSTITUTE OF SCIENCE;
ESPIONAGE - ISRAEL
OO: BUFFALO

ENCLOSED ARE 5 ITEMS.

These items are forwarded to your office since:

X You were OO at the time our case was RUC'd.

Enclosures are described as follows:

3 1-A EXHIBITS
2 FD-302 ORIGINALS
LABORATORY RESULTS
LATENT FINGERPRINT REPORTS
SURVEILLANCE LOGS
FD-192 (GREEN BULKY SHEETS)
TAX RETURNS
OTHER

Enc. (5)
CJS: mke

NOTE: DO NOT BLOCK STAMP ORIGINAL ENCLOSURES

JUN 01 1998
Universal File Case Number 65-77-70-1A(3)

Field Office Acquiring Evidence ALBUQUERQUE

Serial # of Originating Document

Date Received 12-15-92

From  [Signature]

(Name of Contributor)

(Address of Contributor)

By  [Signature]

(Name of Special Agent)

To Be Returned  

Receipt Given  

Grand Jury Material - Disseminate Only Pursuant to Rule 6 (e) Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure

Title:

Reference: ___________________________ (Communication Enclosing Material)

Description: [ ] Original notes re interview of ___________________________

Referral/Consult
FEDERAL BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION
FOIPA
DELETED PAGE INFORMATION SHEET

No Duplication Fees are charged for Deleted Page Information Sheet(s).

Total Deleted Page(s) = 265
Page 3 ~ b6, b7C, b7E
Page 4 ~ b1, b6, b7C, b7E
Page 5 ~ b6, b7C, b7E
Page 6 ~ b6, b7C, b7E
Page 7 ~ b6, b7C, b7E
Page 8 ~ b1, b6, b7C, b7E
Page 9 ~ b6, b7C, b7E
Page 10 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 11 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 12 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 13 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 14 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 15 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 16 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 17 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 18 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 19 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 20 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 21 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 22 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 23 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 24 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 25 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 26 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 27 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 28 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 29 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 30 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 31 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 32 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 33 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 34 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 35 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 36 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 37 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 38 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 39 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 40 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 41 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 42 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 43 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 44 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 45 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)
Page 46 ~ b3 FRCP, Rule 6(e)