

b6

HAROLD LIVINGSTON
[REDACTED]
WESTLAKE VILLAGE, CA 91361

President George W. Bush
1600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20500

Attorney General Michael B. Mukasey
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20530

Gentlemen:

I ask, respectfully, your approval of the pardon (posthumously) application submitted on behalf of Charles Winters. I met and served with Mr. Winters in early 1948 when he provided immense — more accurately, nation-saving — assistance in the acquisition of aircraft for the then nascent Israel Air Force. Please recall that the young nation was then struggling for its very existence and Mr. Winters, although a non-Jew, immediately responded to the call. Ironically, he was the only individual convicted of the crime of evasion of various neutrality acts while other, more highly-positioned volunteers, despite having been convicted of the same "crime," eventually received presidential pardons.. Namely, Herman ("Hank") Greenspun in 1960, and Al Schwimmer in 2000. If American justice is truly to be served, surely this is the means to achieve such.

Sincerely,

/s/ Harold Livingston.